

**Marilyn Stollon**

**December 6, 2015**

## **LABOR MARKET SURVEY**

### **General Manager / Chief of Police Combined Positions**

#### **Overview:**

A labor market survey was performed to determine if there are any current or recently advertised positions for a combined position for General or Town Manager and Chief of Police, in small town settings in CA or the western states. Efforts were made to contact those who could provide additional information on the chain of command, or potential problems inherent in such a position.

Specialized recruiting sites and public sector websites were reviewed to obtain an overall count of how many positions typically exist. Some jobs were reposted on various sites and a rough estimate was made of the total advertised positions over a few weeks.

### **Duties / Changes & Challenges in the Field**

**<http://www.cacitymanagers.org/professional-standards/>**

From the City Management Foundation Website: Early City Managers were recruited from the ranks of civil engineers engaged in the development of the country's infrastructure, building bridges, highways, dams and aqueducts...

Today's City Managers generally hold undergraduate degrees in business, political science, and or public

administration. An increasing number also hold master's degrees in business or public administration.

The three highly experienced city managers profiled on the site are from Millbrae (Raines), Beverly Hills (Kolin) and Vista (Geldert), CA. All three in interviews discussed the changes in the field with requirements and demands by the public “for government to be open, available , responsive and transparent”, (J. Kolin) for fiscal responsibility with all 3 acknowledging issues with “pension costs”. Raines said “pension reform issue is tied to fiscal sustainability”(M.Raines)and Geldert said, “Cities need to live within their means and to establish healthy reserves to weather the uncertain times. Bargaining unit packages need to be reassessed, pension reform is an absolute must, and health benefits need to be reviewed for affordability.”(R.Geldert)

\*The term is also referred to as town manager, and duties vary depending on size of the town, city and complexity of services.

## **1. Review of Job Openings / Specialized websites**

I reviewed recently advertised openings during November, December which I identified using internet sources to identify those recruiting firms and other websites that post or that specialize in recruiting or posting jobs in the public sector for management and law enforcement executive positions. (nothing relevant was identified using indeed, craigslist etc.)

I reviewed approximately 100 job listings from the contacts listed below and checked them to identify small towns etc. and to determine who they were accountable to. No combined positions were identified for gm/cop.

**1. Western City, Monthly Magazine <http://www.westerncity.com/>**

Western City, a monthly magazine of the League of CA cities for job opportunities has over 50 openings in the public sector for separate director and city /town manager positions.

Only one position had a combined title of Public Works Director and City Engineer. The director worked under the assistant city manager.

There were openings for stand alone positions i.e. town manager, city administrator/manager, throughout CA, but none were combined. Examples of small town openings and the posted salary are as follows: Blythe, small city in So.CA., Calistoga, (\$165-182k), Portola Valley, (\$199k),

town manager, Nipomo, pop 4400, (\$135k)

Additionally, there were 10 City Administrator or Manager positions; under the “Other” Category, there were 8 openings under Management; there were no combined positions advertised.

There were also 2 police chief openings, both were described as being accountable to a city manager. The examples with salary are listed as follows: Police chief , Bishop, pop 3800, \$113,400 and Watsonville, pop 50,000, \$123-165k.

**2. Police Executive Research Forum [http://  
www.policeforum.org/career-opportunities](http://www.policeforum.org/career-opportunities)**

Ten chief of police positions were posted nation wide on this

site, none were combined positions.

### **3. IACLEA, International Association of Campus Law Enforcement Administrators, [www.iaclea.org](http://www.iaclea.org)**

This site posts jobs on college or university campuses. There were two combined positions: one for an Assistant VP and Chief of Police for George Mason University; the position oversees the Deputy Chief of Police and the Assistant VP/COP is accountable to the Vice President of the university.

The second position is for Executive Director of Public Safety / Chief of Police, at Springfield College, this combined position reports to the Sr. Vice President of Administration and Finance.

### **4. KRW Associates , a recruiting firm**

**<http://www.krw-associates.com/>**

They search and fill positions in the public sector for executive level positions primarily in Colorado, but also in CA and other states. They are advertising currently for executive jobs including assistant town manager, chief of police, and city manager.

Of the 26 recently filled positions posted on their website, none were combined positions. Ex. Wellington, Co, asst town manager, Delta, Co, city manager and a chief of police, 2 separate positions.

**5. Peckham and McKenney, <http://www.peckhamandmckenney.com/>**

**866-912-1919, Joyce**



They have extensive experience in recruiting police chief and upper management positions in the western states, I spoke with Joyce who has worked in recruiting for 20 years who said that she has not seen a combined position come up in all that time, “due to the conflict of interest”.

Joyce said that the city manager generally hires the chief of police. When asked about part time jobs, she said she has seen a few over the years and that retired individuals typically are interested in that position. They do not come up too often, however.

They are recruiting for a city manager position in Calistoga, pop 5200, town mgr \$165-182k, and for a town manager for Portola Valley (\$199k). Calistoga has a COP, Portola Valley contracts out police services.

**6. Municipal Management Association of Northern California & the ICMA (international city county mgmt assn, for job listings)**

**<http://mmanc.org/jobs.aspx>**

They have around 75+ openings posted including several repeats from the recruiters. Other openings for COP are in Galt and Arvin, small towns and neither are combined.

**1. COMBINED POSITIONS, non public safety**

While occasionally there are combined jobs, there have been none identified on the GM/COP level, and if there is a combined job, it is accountable to a higher level position or the split GM town manager function is split with a non public safety position.

Examples:

-

### 1.Cloverdale

City Manager / City Clerk (4 day position, 32 hrs)

The City Clerk maintains records, conducts elections, Brown Act Compliance, PRAs, information service, admin support to City Council

-

### 2.Sebastopol

City Manager / City Attorney (4 days, 10 hrs)

-

### 3.Corte Madera

Town Manager / Engineer

Town Clerk / Asst Town Mgr

Fire Captain / Paramedic; Fire Engineer / Paramedic

They are part of the Central Marin Police Authority for combined police services to several towns.

-

These positions report to the City Manager

-

Pinole

Development Services Director / City Engineer

Belvedere

City Clerk / Mgmt Analyst

## Piedmont

City Clerk / IS Manager

Payroll / HR Technician

## Ft Bragg

Finance Director / City Treasurer

### **III. EXISTING COMBINED POSITIONS - One currently**

**Broadmoor--** is a census designated place, , pop @ 4,000, has 288 acres and is and has lost property to Daly City as property owners opt to join Daly City, which currently

encircles the town. They have a \$ 2 million budget and reported they have to be fiscally prudent to manage, per an article in 2013. A police commission is comprised of primarily former law enforcement, manages the town and oversees the chief, they have unique structure. The commission per its website, “hears appeals in certain personnel matters”. More recently LAFCO has prepared a report with recommendations focusing on some of the problems in Broadmoor.

\*\*The PD is currently being sued by one of its commissioners for trumped up charges and harassment, its police chief left, and this town is not a model for good governance / nor transparency.

-

## **1. CONTACTS WITH TOWN MANAGERS**

No responses to date from: Cotati, city council, mayor, city manager, COP

Cloverdale, Sebastapol, Ft. Bragg , Brisbane, same set up with council, mayor, city manager and COP.

### **1. Fairfax, CA , Garrett Toy, Town Manager / PWD**

I was in contact with Mr. Toy regarding his opinion of combining a position since his job was now combined due to budget issues. He said:

“As the Town Manager, I currently act as the Public Works Director, but I'm not a licensed engineer. The Town contracts out for a Town Engineer as needed. We do this to save money. Corte Madera has combined the Town Engineer/Town Manager since the person has a PE license.

In general, I've seen combo police/fire chief and I've seen retired police chiefs be appointed Town Managers, **but not a**

**combo COP/TM (general manager).**

The Town Manager reports to the Town Council (board) and then the chief (of police) to the Town Manager. ... Due to the functions of the PD and town administration, I don't think a combo position would work very well because of the potential for conflicts between policing and Council policy.”

## **2. \*Burlingame City Manager, Lisa Goldman**

“On occasion, a Chief of Police or Fire Chief will serve as Acting or Interim City Manager or vice versa, but I'm not aware of any permanent combined public safety / city management positions. I don't know if it's a conflict of interest per se, but it seems to me that it would be hard for one person to do both jobs effectively.” They have a chief of police.



### **3. Colma, Town Manager, Sean Rabe**

\*Colma smallest city, 1400 residents, 2 miles, has a huge tax base with shopping centers, car dealerships and a cardroom. Colma has a city manager, and a chief of police.

I contacted Sean Rabe, the current town manager of Colma regarding his views on a combined GMCOP position on Dec 1. He responded with “I actually do have significant first-hand experience with the dual role of Chief of Police and City Manager. The City where I previously worked had such an arrangement for about nine years -- I was hired as the Asst. City Manager, working under a joint CM/ COP. I was then appointed to the CM role in that same city (Sutter Creek) when the CM resigned. A nearby city to Sutter Creek (Ione) had the same dual role for a short amount of time as well. “

During our conversation, Mr. Rabe said that initially he was a newspaper reporter and looking from the “outside in” he did not see any problems, after he got his degrees he was hired as an assistant town manager. He said that the COP and TM were separate for many years, but when the TM resigned, Sutter Creek combined the position for budgetary reasons. It was combined for a total of 9-10 years, and he came on as assistant town manager after approximately 8 years of the position being combined. After about a 1.5 years after he started as an assistant town manager, the COP/TM resigned when major management problems developed and the position was split again.

\*Mr. Rabe said that in a combined position he observed that it is hard for the COP/GM to “serve 2 masters”, the police dept and the council . As a COP / TM, he said, it is hard for the person to separate the COP and GM roles, because the COP wants “what is best for his men”, and on the other hand the officers ultimately “resent” the GM role, yet the GM needs to deal with fiscal, budget and management demands

and concerns.

\*Most importantly, he said there are clearly different skill sets required for each job, and that the COP is set up as a "paramilitary style of leadership", i.e. law and order skills sets which is not the same nor compatible with a city manager where the focus is on "finance, management, HR related issues". He said that in Colma he is the ultimate "appeal person" and staff can, if need be, work their way up the grievance process. This, he said, is a "system of checks and balances", and you need to have someone at the top who is "not invested in the issues" in order to resolve HR problems.

In Sutter Creek, due to staff changes, increasing management duties, the PD staff became resentful of the time the GM spent on town management issues (in the grand jury rpt). The job was too large for one person to do well, he said.

A Grand Jury investigation in 2010 reviewed areas of concern including finance, administration, police dept , with the recommendation that the GMCOP position be separated, which was done by the council prior to the report being released . There were allegations of financial improprieties, not consulting with the full council, poor recordkeeping, not following auditors recommendations, policy and procedures manuals were out of date & not being followed, problems in the PD, morale, complaints etc.

After the position was split, Mr. Rabe became town manager and was in charge of public works, HR, community development, GPA sewer district, a job he held for several years which in itself was very large in terms of responsibilities. When I asked him about being a public works director and possible conflict of interest in terms of grievances, he said that because it was a small dept of 3 and the members were unionized there was less of a chance of

HR problems, although he said it was “not a good situation” , but that budget and size of the PW dept dictated that.

He added that combining the GMCOP position in Sutter Creek was a budgetary decision, but that it was “not a good long term solution” due to the inherent problems as I indicated.

He added that Ione, a town near Sutter Creek had the same situation occur with a combined position, and the police officers resented not having the full attention of the chief to promote their issues. The position which was combined for a short time was split after problems emerged.

## **1. TOWNS WITH PART TIME GMS**

\*Pt Arena & Muir Beach, both have part time GMs, with shortened days and staff up in hours as needed. Muir Beach has a town manager, and on its website, it states that a secretary and a GM position can be combined.

Pt. Arena has a new part time town manager, Richard Shoemaker, who reports that he has no prior experience as a town manager, although he has other supervisor, city council member etc. experience. He said the job takes more part time hours than one would think. And there are other part time positions available.

## **1. ADDITIONAL ADVERTISED POSITIONS**

### **1. California Police Chiefs Association**

<http://www.californiapolicechiefs.org/job-opportunities->

classifieds

They are advertising for 7 police chief positions. A COP for example for SJ Evergreen College reports to the Vice Chancellor of Administrative Services, and for Alamitos, a small town in Southern CA, the chief of police reports to the city manager.

## **2. Other Public Sector Career Sites**

-ABAG, no appropriate advertised openings in the member jurisdictions

-Calopps.org, no appropriate openings

-CA State Association of Counties, same openings as above, no combined cop/gm positions advertised.

### **3. Additional Executive Recruiting Firms**

Koff & Assoc, no appropriate openings at the mgmt level

<http://koffassociates.com/category/opportunities/>

Ralph Andersen & Associates, retained search firm

[http://www.ralphandersen.com/career\\_opportunities.html](http://www.ralphandersen.com/career_opportunities.html)

They are advertising for several general manager, town manager, city manager positions, and 3 chief of police, positions that were actually advertised on the other sites. This firm, coincidentally was contracted by Kensington to fill our combined position, for which Harman was hired.



Bob Murray & Associates

[http://www.bobmurrayassoc.com/current\\_searches.asp](http://www.bobmurrayassoc.com/current_searches.asp)

They had one opening for city manager, no combined jobs, they also are now providing services for finding interim chief positions.

## **VII. CONCLUSIONS**

A labor market survey was performed to determine if there are other combined positions for GM/COP in the state, and surrounding western states, and if they were identified how they functioned. Focus was on job openings in CA since the CA general code would be applicable.

However, a review of the labor market using a variety of resources did not yield any current or recent openings for a GM/COP.

I reviewed specialized public sector websites, and websites for executive search firms that specialize in these positions. Over 100 advertised openings over a period of 3-4 weeks were reviewed, and as a result of this labor market survey, I have determined that there are no current or recent openings for a combined general manager / chief of police position in CA or surrounding states.

Job openings for non combined positions were also reviewed (GM or COP) on all of these websites to review the chain of command and a number of town managers were contacted.

\*Conflict of interest was cited by both a specialty recruiter

and a city manager in Fairfax as the primary reason that this type of position is not found in a combined public safety and executive position.

Another town manager in Burlingame, said she was not aware of any combined permanent positions, and thought it would be hard for one person to do both jobs effectively.

Lastly, a town manager in Colma, with experience working under a combined GMCOP position in Sutter Creek pointed out the ongoing poor governance problems with this arrangement, why it had to be abandoned in the previous town, per the recommendation of the grand jury, as well as the town, Ione nearby. He cited the major difference in management styles required for the two positions, an impossible dual allegiance to the police dept and council, and the scope of the job being too large for one person to be effective. \*Most importantly, he said there are clearly

different skill sets required for each job, and that the COP is set up as a” paramilitary style of leadership” , i.e. law and order skills sets which is not the same nor compatible with a city manager where the focus is on “finance, management, HR related issues”.

There are however, combined positions that do not appear to be problematic for conflict of interest, where a professional may have 2 specialized areas of responsibility/duties such as fire and emt, or town clerk and asst town mgr, or engineer and town manager, or assistant vp and chief of police.

However, in all cases referred to above, they are accountable to the next supervisory level.

In a few local cities/towns, three city manager positions are combined but it is with city attorney, city clerk, town engineer and there is no conflict of interest. They are Cloverdale, Sebastapol, and Corte Madera.

In conclusion, there are few, if any currently combined positions other than Broadmoor and Kensington, and considering the current, recent and past publicized problems with Broadmoor , it does not appear to be model of governance that can be promoted nor emulated.

A more common approach based on the examples in this research survey for smaller towns in CA is to have a town manager who works part time, 3-4 days a week, or combine that position to create a full time or  $\frac{3}{4}$  time position with city clerk, (admin secretary i.e. Ms. Wolter's position), or attorney etc. The Chief of Police is a separate position, unless police services are contracted out.

Marilyn Stollon, BA\_\_\_\_\_

Vocational Research Consultant / Employment Counselor